Institute for Space Weather Sciences

New Jersey Institute of Technology

Data-based Magnetohydrodynamic Simulations for Solar Eruptions

Satoshi INOUE Center for Solar-Terrestrial Research, New Jersey Institute of Technology Satoshi.Inoue@njit.edu

Who am I?



Name: Satoshi INOUE (Assistant Prof.) Affiliation: Center for Solar-Terrestrial Research, New Jersey Institute of Technology.

Ph.D. : Hiroshima University (2006: Under Prof. Kanya Kusano)



Solar MHD Group: Postdoc x2, Grad students x2, Undergraduate students x 3, High school student x1

References

Referece I:Coronal Magnetic Field

SPRINGER LINK	Log in			
Find a journal Publish with us Track your research Q Search	਼੍ਰੇ Cart			
Home > Living Reviews in Solar Physics > Article Solac foce of pee access (Published: 11 January 2021) Volume 18, article number 1, (2021) (Cite this article) Download PDF	Image: Constraint of the second s			
<u>Thomas Wiegelmann</u> 🖂 & <u>Takashi Sakurai</u>	Use our pre-submission checklist → Avoid common mistakes on your manuscript.Image: Common mistakes on your manuscript.			
Latest version View article history				
b 10k Accesses c 46 Citations \bigcirc 13 Altmetric Explore all metrics \rightarrow	Part of a collection:			
i The <u>Original Version</u> of this article was published on 20 September 2012	Solar Surface and Atmosphere			
_	Sections Figures References			
Abstract	Abstract			

Referece II: Data-Constrained MHD Sim.

Den Springer Open	Search Q	<u>Get published</u>	Explore Journals	<u>Books</u>	<u>About</u>	<u>Login</u>		
Progress in Earth and Planetary Science								
About Articles Submission Guidelines Submit manuscript 🗇								
Review Open access Published: 04 July 2016 Magnetohydrodynamics modeling of corona field and solar eruptions based on the photo magnetic field	Download PDF ★ Section 1. Space and planetary sciences							
Satoshi Inoue Progress in Earth and Planetary Science 3, Article number: 19 (2016) <u>Cite this</u> 4253 Accesses 52 Citations 3 Altmetric <u>Metrics</u> Abstract	<u>article</u>		<u>Abstract</u> <u>Review</u> <u>Conclusions</u> References	Iguico				
In this paper, we summarize current progress on using the observed magn magnetohydrodynamics (MHD) modeling of the coronal magnetic field are including solar flares and coronal mass ejections (CMEs). Unfortunately, existing state-of-the-art solar physics satellites, only the photospheric ma measured. We first review the 3D extrapolation of the coronal magnetic fi	netic fields for nd of solar erup even with the gnetic field can elds from	tions, be	Acknowledgements Author information Additional information Rights and permissions					

Reference III: Data-driven MHD Sim.



· Data-driven models offer a novel avenue to study solar coronal magnetic fields

Such numerical models are directly driven by continuously

Keywords

Graphical abstract

Introduction

Solar Coronal Magnetic Field



The plasma structure changes significantly, before, during, and after the eruption.

What is this energy source? Magnetic energy accumulated in the coronal magnetic field!

Dynamics of Solar Coronal Magnetic Field





2012-08-31 16:00

Dynamics of Solar Coronal Magnetic Field



Solar magnetic field observation

Observation provides only the magnetic field of the solar surface!



In this Lecture

How do we extrapolate the 3D magnetic field ? How does solar eruption occurs?



History of modeling of solar eruption



Modeling of "Static" Solar Coronal Magnetic Field $J \times B = 0$ Force-free Field.

Magnetohydrostatic Condition



 $\mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} - \nabla P + \rho \mathbf{g}$

If the coronal loop meets the equilibrium condition

 $\mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} - \nabla P + \rho \mathbf{g} = 0$

We have to find a solution, **B**, satisfying above equation.

BBSO Summer School: Data-based MHD Simulations for Solar Eruptions, 28 July- 2 August 2024

 ∇P

Plasma $\beta = (P/B^2)$ in the Solar Corona



Force-free field $(J \times B = 0)$

Description of a Force-free field.



- \bigstar A unique solution is guaranteed if the normal component of ${f B}$ is given at the boundary (see supplementary materials.).
- X The potential field has no free magnetic energy that cannot produce the active phenomena (see supplementary materials.).
- ✓ Linear force-free field α = constant. → $\nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \alpha \mathbf{B}$

X An analytical solution exists under the given B.C B_n and α . The magnetic field of the entire active region is sheared...

Potential Field



Potential Field, Linear Force-Free, Nonlinear Force-Free



Nonlinear Force-free Field (NLFFF) Extrapolations

Nonlinear Force-free Field (NLFFF) Extrapolation

Attempting to find the solution of the force-free equation.

$\mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} = 0$ or $\nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \alpha(\mathbf{r})\mathbf{B}$



The Common Issues in the NLFFF Extrapolation

✓ Jx B=0 is a nonlinear equation, so hard to find the analytical solution.

✓ Photospheric mag B has three components, Bx, By, Bz. They do NOT satisfy the force-free condition (Metcalf 1994, Kawabata 2020 etc.).

✓ Potential and linear force-fee field extrapolations require only Bz component. The other components are automatically determined. When the other components are given, no guarantee uniqueness of the solution, or the existence of the solution itself.

There are many methods to extrapolate the force-free magnetic field. Which one is best?

MHD-Relaxation Method

Valori + 2005, Jiang + 2011, Inoue+2014...

We solve zero-beta MHD equations until the Mag B reaches the (near) force-free state.

Zero-beta MHD equations

 $\mathbf{v} \quad \rho(\mathbf{r}, t) = |\mathbf{B}(\mathbf{r}, t)|$ $\mathbf{v} \quad \rho \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} = -\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} + \nu \nabla^2 \mathbf{v}$ $\mathbf{v} \quad \frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) + \eta \nabla^2 \mathbf{B} - \nabla \phi$ $\mathbf{v} \quad \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} = -c_h^2 \nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \phi$ $\mathbf{v} \quad \nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \mathbf{J}$

1. The potential field is prepared as the initial condition. This is extrapolated from the observed B_z .

- 2. Tangential components Bx and By are replaced by the observed values at the solar surface.
- 3. The zero-beta MHD equations are iterated until the magnetic field converges to near the force-free state.

What is
$$\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} = -c_h^2 \nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \phi$$
 ?

Cleaning the errors from Div B (Dedner + 2002).

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) + \eta \nabla^2 \mathbf{B} - \nabla \phi$$

$$\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} = -c_h^2 \nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \phi$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} + \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \frac{\partial (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} + \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \frac{\partial (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} + \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \frac{\partial (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} + \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \frac{\partial (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} + \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \frac{\partial (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} + \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \frac{\partial (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})}{\partial t^2} = c_h^2 \nabla^2 (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B})$$





3D Magnetic Field in AR12673

Solar Active Region 12673, X2.2 and X9.3 @ Sep. 6 2017



Achievements of the NLFFF

NLFFF Before and After the Flare



MHD Sim. of Solar Eruption in AR11158

Inoue+2018 Nature Communications







MHD Sim. of Solar Eruption in AR12673 Inoue et al. 2018 ApJ





MHD Sim. of Solar Eruption in AR11261



Mr. Kei Matsumoto



MHD Sim. of Solar Eruption in AR11283



Solar Flare Prediction for X flares



初理学に基づく方法により差し迫 巨大太陽フレアを予測することが

A physics-based method that can predict imminent large solar flares



上左から草野 完也、伊集 朝哉 下左から伴場 由美、井上 諭 **草野 完也** Kanya Kusano 名古屋大学 宇宙地球環境研究所 所長・教授 伊集 朝哉 Tomoya Iju 国立天文台 太陽観測科学プロジェクト 特任専門員

伴場由美 Yumi Bamba 名古屋大学高等研究院·宇宙地球環境研究所特任助教

井上諭 Satoshi Inoue 名古屋大学宇宙地球環境研究所協力研究員

Kanya Kusano¹ Tomoya Iju² Yumi Bamba^{1,3} Satoshi Inoue¹ ¹ Institute for Space-Earth Environmental Research, Nagoya University ² National Astronomical Observatory of Japan ³ Institute for Advanced Research, Nagoya University 全著者リスト: https://science.sciencemag.org/content/369/6503/587.full

Prediction of M- and C- flares

- ✓ Prediction of the flare in non- δ type sunspot.
- Prediction of the filament eruption from quite region.
- Prediction of CMEs.
 - Clarify the physics of the CME initiations.

Dark side of the NLFFF

DeRosa et al. 2009 ApJ



Winter School Concepts in Solar Physics @NIT Delhi 19-23 December 2023

Why do I use the MHD Relaxation Method?

The MHD Relaxation Method is a physics-based model!!



Why do I use MHD Relaxation Method?



Non-force-free field extrapolation ($\mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} - \nabla P = 0$)



Data-constrained and -driven MHD Simulations

What are data-constrained and -driven simulations?

How to handle the following equation at the bottom surface?

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = -\nabla \times \mathbf{E} = \nabla \times \left(\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}\right)$$

Initial condition is along with the observations (potential field, or NLFFF). But the handling of the B.C. is different.

Data-constrained MHD simulation (Use the Photo.B. at specific time).

- The normal component (Bz) is fixed.
- The horizontal B (Bx, By) is freely moving.
- ✓ In some cases, three-components are fixed.. this is not good.

Data-driven MHD simulation (Use the time-varying Photo B.).

Time-varying photo B is applied to the bottom boundary condition.

How to drive the coronal magnetic field ?

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = -\nabla \times \mathbf{E} = \nabla \times (\nabla \times \mathbf{B})$$

Driven by the time-varying velocity

The time-varying velocity field is derived from the time-varying photo. B.
 Mag. B is updated by the induction equation.

No guarantee that Updated B matches with observed (photo.) B.

- Driven by the time-varying Electric field
 - The time-varying electric field is derived from the time-varying photo. B.



Driven by the time-varying Electric field and the velocity.

This condition is inconsistent with the induction equation.

One of E-driven Methods (Hayashi+2018, Inoue+2023)

k=1

 $(z = \Delta z)$

k=1/2

 $(z=\Delta z/2)$

k=-1/2

 $(z=-\Delta z/2)$



Benchmark test is required

Amari et al. 2000, 2003a and b, Aulanier et al. 2010, 2012 etc.

(ii) Eruption of the magnetic field

(i) Sigmoid formation





Reference magnetic field: velocity is given on the surface.

(i) Sigmoid is formed: twisting motion is given on the sunspot.

(ii) Eruption of the magnetic field: Converging motion is given on the sunspot.

Winter School Concepts in Solar Physics @NIT Delhi 19-23 December 2023

How to drive the Coronal magnetic Field?



A Zero-Beta MHD Simulation

Zero-beta MHD equations are applied to data-constrained and -driven simulations.

$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} = -\nabla \cdot \rho \mathbf{v} \text{ or } \rho(\mathbf{r}, t) = |\mathbf{B}(\mathbf{r}, t)|$$
Continuous equation
$$\rho \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} = -\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} + \nu \nabla^2 \mathbf{v}$$
Equation of equation
$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) + \eta \nabla^2 \mathbf{B} - \nabla \phi$$
Induction equation
$$\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} = -c_h^2 \nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \phi$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \mathbf{J}$$
Remove errors from
$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B}$$
Ampere's law

Results of data-driven MHD Sim.

Inoue, Hayashi & Miyoshi, ApJ (i) Sigmoid formation (ii) Eruption of the magnetic field 200 -0.2 III/B

Both stages are reproduced well by data-driven MHD simulation.

Data-Driven MHD simulation of AR12371



Mag B. (15 min. before the flare) created by data-driven sim.



Magnetic configurations are much different between the NLFFF and the one obtained from the data-driven MHD simulation.

Latest Achievement

Motivation of This Study

Solar flare observed by Goode Solar Telescope (GST) at Big Bear Solar Observatory (BBSO)

Wang et al. 2017



GST Observation

COSPAR 2024 E2.6 @Busan, Korea 13-21 July 2024

Magnitude of Small-scale Emerging Flux



Recipe of Numerical Method

Zero-beta MHD equations

$$\mathbf{v} \quad \rho(\mathbf{r}, t) = |\mathbf{B}(\mathbf{r}, t)|$$

$$\mathbf{v} \quad \rho \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} = -\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{J} \times \mathbf{B} + \nu \nabla^2 \mathbf{v}$$

$$\mathbf{v} \quad \frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) + \eta \nabla^2 \mathbf{B} - \nabla \phi$$

$$\mathbf{v} \quad \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} = -c_h^2 \nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{c_h^2}{c_p^2} \phi$$

$$\mathbf{v} \quad \nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \mathbf{J}$$

- I. Nonlinear force-free field extrapolation NLFFF extrapolation (Inoue+2014), which is 1 hour before an M6.5 flare, is carried out. However, the NLFFF is almost static field.
- II. Data-driven MHD simulation. Data-driven MHD simulation (Hayashi +2018, Inoue+2023) is conducted using NLFFF as the initial condition. We create the pre-eruption magnetic field which is non-static field.
- III. Data-constrained MHD simulation. Data-constrained MHD simulation (Inoue+2016) is conducted using mag B. created by the data-driven MHD sim. B_x and B_y at the bottom are free.

Data-driven MHD Sim. W/O Emerging Flux



Overview of the Eruption



Modeled Small-scale Emerging Flux



With/Without Small-scale EMF



With/Without Disturbances



With disturbances





Summary

Please understand what is advantage/disadvantage in software for force-free extrapolation, MHD simulation you will use.

 If you did not, you cannot understand the physical significant of output data.

The science paper written with the data you don't understand well is NOT reliable.

I hope that young students join and inject energy into the field of data-based MHD modeling.